

SECTION .0700 - APPEALS

11 NCAC 23A .0701 REVIEW BY THE FULL COMMISSION

(a) Notice of Appeal. Application for review shall be made to the Commission within 15 days from the date when notice of the Deputy Commissioner's Opinion and Award was given. A letter requesting review shall be considered an application for review to the Full Commission within the meaning of G.S. 97-85, provided that the letter specifies the Order or Opinion and Award from which appeal is taken.

(b) Motions to Reconsider to the Deputy Commissioner. A motion to reconsider or to amend the decision of a Deputy Commissioner shall be filed with the Deputy Commissioner within 15 days of receipt of notice of the award. The time for filing a request for review from the decision of a Deputy Commissioner under the rules in this Subchapter shall be tolled until a motion to reconsider or to amend the decision has been ruled upon by the Deputy Commissioner. However, if either party files a letter requesting review of the decision as set forth in Paragraph (a) of this Rule after a motion to reconsider or to amend has been filed with the Deputy Commissioner, jurisdiction shall be transferred to the Full Commission. Any party who had a pending motion to reconsider or amend the decision of the Deputy Commissioner may file a motion with the Chair of the Commission requesting remand to the Deputy Commissioner with whom the motion was pending. Upon remand, jurisdiction shall be transferred to the Deputy Commissioner. Following the Deputy Commissioner's ruling on the motion to reconsider or amend the decision, a party requesting review of the initial decision of the Deputy Commissioner or the ruling on the motion to reconsider or amend the decision shall file a letter requesting review as set forth in Paragraph (a) of this Rule to transfer jurisdiction of the matter back to the Full Commission.

(c) Acknowledging Receipt; Form 44; Joint Certification. The Commission shall acknowledge the request for review by letter. The Commission shall prepare the official transcript and exhibits, if any, and provide them along with a Form 44 Application for Review to the parties involved in the appeal at no charge within 30 days of the acknowledgement letter.

(1) The official transcript and exhibits and a Form 44 Application for Review shall be provided electronically to parties represented by counsel. In such cases, the Commission shall send an email to the parties with directions on how to obtain an electronic copy of the official transcript and exhibits. The e-mail shall also provide instructions for the submission of the parties' acknowledgement of receipt of the Form 44 Application for Review and the official transcript and exhibits to the Commission. Parties represented by counsel shall sign a joint certification acknowledging receipt of the Form 44 Application for Review and the official transcript and exhibits and submit the certification within 10 days of receipt of the Form 44 Application for Review and the official transcript and exhibits. The certification shall stipulate the date the Form 44 Application for Review and the official transcript and exhibits were received by the parties and shall note the date the appellant's brief is due. The Commission shall save a copy of the parties' acknowledgements in the file for the claim to serve as record of the parties' electronic receipt of the Form 44 Application for Review and the official transcript and exhibits.

(2) In cases where it is not possible to provide a party with the official transcript and exhibits electronically, the Commission shall serve the official transcript and exhibits and a Form 44 Application for Review via any class of U.S. Mail that is fully prepaid.

(d) Appellant's Form 44. The appellant shall submit a Form 44 Application for Review stating with particularity all assignments of error and grounds for review, including, where applicable, the pages in the transcript or the record on which the alleged errors shall be recorded. Grounds for review and assignments of error not set forth in the Form 44 Application for Review are deemed abandoned, and argument thereon shall not be heard before the Full Commission.

(e) Timing Requirements. The appellant shall file the Form 44 Application for Review and brief in support of the grounds for review with the Commission with a certificate of service on the appellee within 25 days after receipt of the transcript or receipt of notice that there will be no transcript. The appellee shall have 25 days from service of the Form 44 Application for Review and appellant's brief to file a responsive brief with the Commission. The appellee's brief shall include a certificate of service on the appellant. When an appellant fails to file a brief, an appellee shall file its brief within 25 days after the appellant's time for filing the Form 44 Application for Review and appellant's brief has expired. A party who fails to file a brief shall not participate in oral argument before the Full Commission. If multiple parties request review, each party shall file an appellant's brief and appellee's brief on the schedule set forth in this Paragraph. If the matter has not been calendared for hearing, a party may obtain a single extension of time not to exceed 15 days by filing a written stipulation pursuant to Rule .0108 of this Subchapter.

(f) **Brief Requirements.** Briefs to the Full Commission shall not exceed 35 pages, excluding attachments. In no event shall attachments be used to circumvent the 35-page limit or as a means to submit documents into evidence. No page limit applies to the length of attachments. Briefs shall be prepared using a 12 point proportional font and serif typeface, shall be double spaced, and shall be prepared with non-justified right margins. Each page of the brief shall be numbered at the bottom of the page. When a party quotes or paraphrases testimony or other evidence from the appellate record in the party's brief, the party shall include, at the end of the sentence in the brief that quotes or paraphrases the testimony or other evidence, a parenthetical entry that designates the source of the quoted or paraphrased material and the page number within the applicable source. The party shall use "T" to refer to the transcript of hearing testimony and "Ex" for exhibit. For example, if a party quotes or paraphrases material located in the hearing transcript on page 11, the party shall use the following format "(T 11)," and if a party quotes or paraphrases material located in an exhibit on page 12, the party shall use the following format "(Ex 12)." When a party quotes or paraphrases testimony in the transcript of a deposition in the party's brief, the party shall include the last name of the deponent and the page on which such testimony is located. For example, if a party quotes or paraphrases the testimony of John Smith, located on page 11 of such deposition, the party shall use the following format "(Smith 11)." Parties shall not discuss matters outside the record, assert personal opinions or relate personal experiences, or attribute wrongful acts or motives to opposing counsel or members of the Commission.

(g) **Reply Briefs.** Within 10 days of service of the appellee's brief, a party may request by motion to file a reply brief. The motion shall not contain a reply brief. A reply brief may only be filed if ordered by the Full Commission. Reply briefs shall not exceed 15 pages, excluding attachments. Reply briefs shall be prepared in accordance with the requirements of Paragraph (f) of this Rule. Any reply brief filed shall be limited to a concise rebuttal of arguments set out in the appellee's brief, and shall not reiterate arguments set forth in the appellant's principal brief.

(h) **Citations.** Case citations shall be to the North Carolina Reports, the North Carolina Court of Appeals Reports, or the North Carolina Reporter, and when possible, to the South Eastern Reporter. An unpublished appellate decision does not constitute controlling legal authority. If a party believes that an unpublished opinion has precedential or persuasive value to a material issue in the case and that there is no published opinion that would serve as well, the party may cite the unpublished opinion. When citing an unpublished opinion, a party shall indicate the opinion's unpublished status. If no reporter citation is available at the time a brief is filed, the party citing to the case shall attach a copy of the case to its brief.

(i) **Motions.** After a request for review has been submitted to the Full Commission, any motions related to the issues for review shall be filed with the Full Commission, with service on the other parties. Motions related to the issues for review including motions for new trial, to supplement the record, including documents from offers of proof, or to take additional evidence, filed during the pendency of a request for review to the Full Commission, shall be considered by the Full Commission at the time of review of the appeal, except motions related to the official transcript and exhibits. The Full Commission, for good cause shown, may rule on such motions prior to oral argument.

(j) **Oral Argument.**

- (1) Each appellant shall have 20 minutes to present oral argument and may reserve any amount of the twenty-minute total allotment for rebuttal, unless otherwise specified by Order of the Commission. Each appellee shall also have 20 minutes to present oral argument, unless otherwise specified by Order of the Commission. The appellee(s) may not reserve rebuttal time. In the case of cross-appeals, each appealing party may reserve rebuttal time.
- (2) Any party may request additional time to present oral argument in excess of the 20-minute allowance. Such requests shall be made in writing and submitted to the Full Commission no less than 10 days prior to the scheduled hearing date. The written request for additional time shall state with particularity the reason(s) for the request of additional time and the amount of additional time requested.
- (3) An employee appealing the amount of a disfigurement award shall personally appear before the Full Commission to permit the Full Commission to view the disfigurement.
- (4) A party may waive oral argument or appearance before the Commission at any time with approval of the Commission. Upon the request of a party or on its own initiative, the Commission may review the case and file an Order or Award without oral argument or appearance before the Commission.
- (5) If any party fails to appear before the Full Commission upon the call of the case, the Commission may, in the interests of justice or judicial economy, disallow the party's right to present oral argument. If neither party appears upon the call of the case, the Full Commission may decide the case upon the record and briefs on appeal, unless otherwise ordered.

- (6) Parties shall not discuss matters outside the record, assert personal opinions, relate personal experiences, or attribute wrongful acts or motives to opposing counsel or members of the Commission.

History Note: Authority G.S. 97-80(a); 97-85;
Eff. January 1, 1990;
Amended Eff. November 1, 2014; January 1, 2011; August 1, 2006; June 1, 2000;
Recodified from 04 NCAC 10A .0701 Eff. June 1, 2018;
Amended Eff. January 1, 2019.